



PLANNING REPORT

Architectural Review Board

Thursday, February 22, 2017

Case Summary

Agenda Item	1
Title	76-82 S. High Street
Case Number	17-008ARB-SPR
Proposal	This is a proposal for a mixed use development located to the rear of a site with existing historic commercial buildings.
Request	Site Plan Review Review and approval of a Site Plan Review under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.066.
Site Location	East of South High Street, south of the intersection with Eberly Hill Lane.
Applicant	Pete Coratola, CBS Garvey, LLC.
Case Manager	Lori Burchett, AICP, Planner II (614) 410-4656 lburchett@dublin.oh.us
Recommendation	Approval of the Site Plan with the following 16 conditions, 10 Waivers, fee in lieu of open space and parking plan:
Site Plan Waivers	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Roof Type Requirements (3)2) Parking Location3) Transparency Requirements (2)4) Building Entrances5) Permitted Materials6) Retaining Wall Height7) Foundation Plantings
Parking Plan	Approve the reduction of required parking from 22 to 20 parking spaces.
Fee in Lieu	Approve a fee paid in lieu of the provision of open space.

Conditions:

- 1) That the applicant works with staff to relocate transformers and AC units to a location more interior to the site, to the extent possible;
- 2) That the applicant reduces the size of the upper balcony (length and depth) and detach the upper balcony from the lower balcony;
- 3) That the applicant works with staff to identify a more appropriate location for the bicycle parking area;
- 4) That the applicant revises the plan to show use of a stacked stone wall for the street wall provided on Blacksmith Lane in accordance with Code;
- 5) That additional shrubs of a similar mix as currently shown, be provide along the northerly street wall along Blacksmith Lane to meet Code;
- 6) That the applicant ensures all light fixtures and site photometrics meet Code, and any outstanding information be provided as part of the building permitting;
- 7) That the applicant file an application to combine the two lots prior to issuance of the building permit;
- 8) That the applicant conceals all roof penetrations (fans, exhaust, vents, etc.) and ensure these will not be visible from principal frontage streets;
- 9) That the doors for commercial uses along the street frontages shall be consistent with the design of the principal entrances and include full glass and full operating hardware;
- 10) That the applicant ensures all recesses and/or projections required for vertical facade divisions shall meet the required depth of 18 inches;
- 11) That all sign details shall be approved by the ARB, prior to the installation of signs;
- 12) That the construction of the proposed development is subject to the approval of the demolition request;
- 13) That if a change of use should occur to include a different mix of uses for the existing or proposed buildings that require additional parking provisions, the applicant would be required to gain approval of a modified Parking Plan from the ARB;
- 14) Northern portion of the proposed street wall be relocated to provide screening of the A/C units, gas meters, and transformer on the eastern side of the building;
- 15) Dormers should be recessed 12 inches; and
- 16) Approval of the western elevation design is subject to the building permit review process.

Facts	
Site Area	±0.25 acres
Zoning	BSD-HC, Historic Core District
Surrounding Zoning And Uses	North, South and West: BSD-HC, Historic Code District East: BSD-HR, Historic Residential District
Site Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Three existing historic structures located along South High Street (see attached OHI sheets for details). • Two accessory structures located to the rear of the property adjacent to the gravel parking area. (Request for demolition, as a separate application.) • Alley access provided to the site from Blacksmith Lane with overhead power lines running parallel along the rear property line. • Significant grade change from west to east of approximately 16 feet.
Case Background	<p>November 16, 2016 The Basic Plan application was reviewed and approved by the Architectural Review Board (ARB) and included the retention of the historic structures along South High Street and the new development of a 2 and 3-story mixed-use building directly behind the existing historic structures. The new building was oriented north and south on the site. A surface parking lot was located between the new building and Blacksmith Lane with vehicular access from Blacksmith Lane. A plaza area was shown between the existing historic buildings and the new development. The ARB approved a series of waivers to the parking location, front property line coverage, corner occupancy requirements, and corner side RBZ requirements. The ARB denied the waiver request to permit a three-story building, and added a condition of approval that the applicant reduce the height to meet the building story requirements.</p> <p>February 16, 2017 The ART reviewed the Site Plan application and recommended approval of the proposal to ARB.</p>
Review Process	<p>The following outlines the review and approval procedures and the general sequence of each required application.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Demolition: Reviewed and approved by the Architectural Review Board. 2. Basic Plan Application: Reviewed by ART with recommendation forwarded to Architectural Review Board for determination (Case 16-082ARB-BPR approved November 16, 2016). 3. Site Plan Application: Review by the ART with a recommendation forwarded to the Architectural Review Board for a determination. 4. Building Permits through Building Standards.

Details	Site Plan Review
Proposal	<p>The proposal includes the retention of the historic structures along South High Street and the proposed development of a mixed-use building oriented towards Eberly Hill Lane. The proposed building was reoriented east-west on the site to accommodate the reduction to number of stories to meet the Code permitted maximum of 2.5 stories.</p> <p>The proposed mixed use building includes ground floor parking, first story office and second story residential. Parking continues to be accessed from Blacksmith Lane and the proposed dumpster has be relocated to the southwest corner of the site, beneath a proposed set of stairs. A retaining wall extends the length of the southern property line, tapering down from High Street to Blacksmith Lane. A hardscape area is shown between the existing historic buildings and the proposed development.</p> <p>A separate demolition (Case 17-007ARB) application has been submitted for the accessory structures to the rear of the property and three sets of stairs on the existing structure.</p>
Use	<p>The Historic Core District permits a mix of uses including, multiple family, office, retail, and restaurant. The existing and proposed buildings include 6,160 square feet of office, and two multiple-family dwelling units. Parking is located within two, two-car attached garages proposed at the rear of the building, which will require a waiver.</p>
Building Type	<p>The proposal identifies the Historic Mixed Use Building Type, which is permitted within the BSD Historic Core District.</p>
Building Location	<p>The proposed building is located east and south of the existing historic buildings, oriented along Eberly Hill Lane with access to the site proposed from Blacksmith Lane. The proposed building was re-oriented on the site from the Basic Plan to better incorporate the building into the existing grade change and the existing neighborhood. The front façade of the building faces Eberly Hill Lane and steps down from High Street. The building is setback from Blacksmith Lane approximately 13-feet. The façade facing Blacksmith Lane has included architectural details including a mix of materials, windows, doors, and dormers along with landscaping, to better integrate into the neighborhood. The revised building location meets the Bridge Street District requirements, which were previously waived with the Basic Plan Review.</p> <p>The proposal is located on two separate parcels, which will be required to be combined prior to issuance of building permits.</p>
Access	<p>Vehicular access to the site is provided from a single curb cut along Blacksmith Lane.</p>
Parking	<p>Code requires 22 parking spaces for the office and residential uses within the existing and proposed buildings. The plan provides 20 parking spaces (4 parking spaces within the two, two-car garage located to the rear of the proposed building, 13 off-street parking spaces, and 3 on-street parking</p>

Details	Site Plan Review
	<p>spaces). The applicant is requesting approval of a Parking Plan to allow for the 20 parking spaces where 22 are required. The proposed parking spaces provided in the garages require a Waiver, as parking provided in the building is not permitted. A similar Waiver was approved with the Basic Plan, but due to the revisions to the proposed plans the request for approval was included.</p> <p>The off-street parking spaces are accessed from the curb cut along Blacksmith Lane. The plans shows 13 parking spaces in the southern portion of the site separated by a 22-foot dead end drive aisle. Along the southern property line a retaining wall is proposed along the western half of the parking area with a landscaped island along the other half. The applicant has revised the plan to address code requirements and maneuverability discussed during Basic Plan Review.</p> <p>The site is subject to a documented parking agreement approved with the Harvest Pizza parking plan approval. The signed agreement states four parking spaces will be provided on the 76-78 S. High Street site for employees at 4 N. High Street, with primary use during evening hours (5-10pm). The hours specified to accommodate the restaurant are the typical off-peak hours for the proposed office uses, creating minimal conflicts for use and enforcement of the agreement.</p>
Building Height and Stories	<p>Code permits a Historic Mixed Use Building with a maximum of 2.5 stories, while the Historic Dublin Design Guidelines recommends new development should be a maximum of two stories. The Historic Dublin Design Guidelines recommend new construction follow the same setbacks as surrounding buildings, does not exceed 2 stories at grade, and is designed with carefully controlled proportions. The Guidelines state building design may need to include smaller masses rather than a single large form. The residents and ARB expressed concerns about the scale and height of the building as part of the informal review and during Basic Plan Review.</p> <p>The ARB did not approve a waiver to allow the proposed 3 stories. The revised building proposal meets the code requirement of 2.5 stories, as directed by ARB during the Basic Plan approval. The proposal has a similar setback from the street with a minor increase in the setback along Eberly Hill Lane, which allows the proposed building to be stepped back from the existing structures. The revised design takes advantage of the grade and steps the building down the hill toward Blacksmith Lane, allowing for a decreased mass while maintaining the permitted maximum number of building stories.</p>
Architecture and Materials	<p>Eberly Hill Lane and S. Blacksmith Lane require street entrances on the building. A main building entrance is located along the Eberly Hill frontage; however, a waiver will be required to reduce the number of building entrances required from three to one. A single required entrance is provided on Blacksmith Lane. An additional entrance is located on the western end of</p>

Details	Site Plan Review
	<p>the building within the proposed plaza area.</p> <p>Code permits the use of brick, stone and wood siding for buildings within the Historic Core. The proposal includes the use of chiseled limestone, lap fiber cement plank siding and trim details, and aluminum-clad wood windows, standing seam metal, and asphalt roof materials. A waiver will be required to permit the use of fiber cement plank siding as a primary material. ART added a condition requiring the proposed dormers to be recessed 12 inches to provide additional depth and be more architecturally appropriate.</p> <p>Exterior lighting and railing materials have been selected to complement similar details within the historic district.</p>
Open Space	<p>Code requires 524 square feet of public open space be provided with the proposed uses. The plans designate an open space area of 1,110 square feet in between the existing building and the proposed building, stepped down from High Street. Staff expressed concerns with the location and its lack of accessibility to the public. ART agreed with the concerns and recommended approval to the ARB of a fee paid in lieu of the provision of open space for the site.</p>
Landscape Details and lighting	<p>The details provided on the landscape plan generally meet the requirements of the Bridge Street District. Minor revisions can be addressed at building permit and will not alter the overall proposal. A Waiver has been added to permit a decreased depth for foundation plantings on the southern elevation.</p>
Stormwater Management and Utilities	<p>The existing utilities are available and would service the proposed expansion. Preliminary stormwater details have been provided. More detailed stormwater management will to be addressed as part of the building permit review.</p>

Analysis	Site Plan Review
Site Plan Waiver Review	
Review Criteria	<p>The designated reviewing body is required to review the proposed Waivers based on the following review criteria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) The need for the Waiver is caused by unique site conditions, the use of or conditions on the property or surrounding properties, or other circumstances outside the control of the owner/lessee, including easements and rights-of-way; (b) The Waiver, if approved, will generally meet the spirit and intent of the Bridge Street District Plan and supports the commonly accepted principles of walkable urbanism; (c) The Waiver is not being requested solely to reduce cost or as a matter of general convenience; (d) The Waiver, if approved, will ensure that the development is of equal or greater development quality with respect to design, materials and other

Analysis	Site Plan Review
	<p>similar development features than without the Waiver;</p> <p>(e) The requested Waiver would better be addressed through the Waiver rather than an amendment to the requirements of this Chapter;</p> <p>(f) For Development Plans, the other Development Plan elements not affected by the Waiver will be generally consistent with Code Section 153.060(A) and Code Section 153.061(A); and</p> <p>(g) For Site Plan Reviews and Minor Project Reviews, the Waiver does not have the effect of authorizing any use or open space type that is not otherwise permitted in that BSD zoning district.</p>
<p>Roof Type Requirements (3)</p>	<p>Building Type–Section 153.062(D) (2) (a) – Pitched Roof Type – Roof Structure. Hipped and gable roofs are permitted, in addition to roofs with combinations of hips and gables.</p> <p>Building Type–Section 153.062(D) (2) (h) – Roof Type – Gambrel and Mansard Roofs. Gambrel and mansard roofs are permitted only for single family detached buildings, unless otherwise determined to be architecturally appropriate by the required reviewing body for other building types.</p> <p>Building Type–Section 153.062(O)(9)(d)(6) - Permitted Types — Pitched roof; other types permitted with approval. Pitched roof with flat area and gambrel roof proposed.</p> <p>The proposed roof is a combination of compound gabled and hipped roofs. The middle portion of the roof is a gambrel roof, and the roofs on either side are pitched with a flat roof area on each as a result of the roof pitch being ‘clipped’ to minimize the height of the roof.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> The applicant has designed the roof types to provide architectural interest and break-up the massing of the building. The intent is for the building to appear as three separate buildings with varied building design and roof style. The applicant has incorporated a slightly steeper pitch than traditional gambrel style to better tie into the adjoining roof style.</p>
<p>Parking location</p>	<p>Historic Mixed Use Building Type–Section 153.062(O)(9) – Parking within a building is not permitted.</p> <p>The proposed plans include two, two car garages attached to the rear of the building.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> The reorientation of the building removed the parking from underneath the building, reducing the mass and height of the building. The garages are located within the proposed off-street parking lot to the rear of the building and setback from the street.</p>
<p>Transparency Requirements</p>	<p>Historic Mixed Use Building Type–Section 153.062(O)(9) – Ground Story Street Façade Transparency: 40%. Eberly Hill (North): 31% proposed and S. Blacksmith Lane (East): 33% proposed.</p>

Analysis	Site Plan Review
	<p>Historic Mixed Use Building Type–Section 153.062(O)(9) – Ground Story Non-Street Facing Transparency: 15%. Parking lot (South): 13% proposed.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> Due to the grade transition on the site there is limited ability to include additional windows. The overall design window design is cohesive and symmetric.</p>
Building Entrances	<p>Building Type–Section 153.062(O)(9)(d)(3) – Street Facades: Number of Entrances Required – 1 per 40 feet of façade for buildings over 60 feet minimum. Eberly Hill: 3 required, 1 entrance provided.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> The interior layout and the proposed uses do not accommodate additional door locations. Site constraints due to the grading limit the areas where doors can be placed. The proposed entrances are prominently located and easily identifiable.</p>
Permitted Materials	<p>Building Type–Section 153.062(O)(9)(d)(5) – Façade Materials: Permitted Primary Materials – Stone, Brick, Wood Siding. Fiber Cement Siding proposed.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> The applicant is proposing a high-quality fiber cement siding to create diversity in the overall aesthetic of the building. The material is being used to break up the stone and give the appearance of multiple structures. The fiber cement siding is appropriate for new construction and gives a similar appearance of wood siding.</p>
Retaining Wall Height	<p>Site Development Standards 153.065 – (E)(1)(b) – Wall Height: No fence or wall located between the principal structure on a lot and the side or rear property line shall exceed six feet in height. Proposed retaining wall is approximately 12 feet in height as measured from established grade at the parking area.</p> <p><i>Criteria Met.</i> The height of the wall was necessary due to the site constraints caused by the grade change. The applicant is proposing to use high quality materials to reflect the historic character of the district as well as landscaping along the face of the wall to add visual interest.</p>
Foundation Plantings	<p>Site Development Standards –153.065(D)(7) – Foundation Planting: Building foundation landscaping is required along all sides of a building not otherwise occupied by entrances, sidewalk, parking or loading areas, or similar areas. Foundation landscaping is not required for portion of the front or corner side building façades located within 10 feet of the front property line and where a streetscape or patio is provided.</p> <p>The front building façade is 5 feet from the front property line and no foundation planting is required in this location. Foundation planting is required along the corner side (east) and rear facade (south) and a portion of the side façade (west) of the building. The minimum dimension of the landscape bed depth is not met along the southern elevation.</p>

Analysis		Site Plan Review	
		<i>Criteria Met.</i> The applicant has laid out the structure and parking area that best utilizes the existing site conditions while providing landscaping throughout the site to meet code requirements. Due to the layout of the structure and its proximity to the property line, the foundation plantings were not appropriate in these locations. The applicant has provided additional landscaping and street walls to help meet the intent of this requirement.	
Parking Plan			
Process		The designated reviewing body is required to review the proposed parking plan based on the review criteria found in Code Section 153.065(B)(2)(b)(6)A-H.	
Parking Plan		The applicant is requesting to reduce the number of required parking spaces from 22 to 20. The proposed plans utilize the available on-street parking, and provide an efficient off-street parking out. Areas within the parking area exist where additional parking spaces would dimensionally fit, but maneuverability is limited and not recommended. The proposed combination of uses on site for office and residential typically off-set each other with regard to peak time usage. Should a change of use occur to include retail or restaurant to the existing or proposed buildings, the applicant would be required to gain approval of a modified parking plan, as these uses require additional parking spaces.	
Fee in Lieu of Open Space			
Process		Where the required reviewing body has determined that a payment of a fee-in-lieu of open space is permitted, the procedures for open space determination shall be met per §153.066.	
Request		The applicant is requesting a fee-in-lieu of open space considering that (a) the amount of open space (±530 sf) would yield a lesser benefit than paying the fee; (b) open space is available within 660-feet (Frog Park); (c) the significant grade and maintaining existing historic structures, make it impractical to provide the required open space; (d) providing the required space would hamper efficient layout; and (e) the open space would conflict with the Principles of Walkable Urbanism in §153.065(I).	
Site Plan Review			
Similar to Basic Plan		<i>Criterion met with conditions and waivers.</i> The site design approved with the Basic Plan has been modified with the Site Plan to meet the condition of approval regarding number of building stories. The significant grade change across the site presents challenges for development to locate the building and parking appropriately and meet the building type requirements. The modifications to the site layout more closely meet the intent for development within the BSD. The building is located along the street edge, parking is located to the rear of the building, and the building story requirements are met.	

Analysis		Site Plan Review
Consistency with Development Plan	<i>Criterion not applicable.</i>	
Meets Sections 153.059 and 153.062-153.65	<i>Criterion met with conditions and waivers.</i> A detailed review of the requirements is attached. Any additional requirements will be met at building permit. Waivers addressing roof types, door locations, materials, and transparency are appropriate given the existing site conditions.	
Safe and Efficient Circulation	<i>Criterion met with conditions.</i> The applicant has revised the site plan to demonstrate adequate internal vehicular circulation by adjusting travel lane widths and general parking layout. The applicant will continue to work with staff to identify a more appropriate location for bicycle parking.	
Relationship of Buildings	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed layout of the site and its integration of historical architectural elements does provide for coordination and integration of the development within the surrounding area, while maintaining the high quality image of the city.	
Open Space	<i>Criterion met with fee in lieu.</i> The ART recommends the open space provisions be met with a fee paid in lieu of open space.	
Adequate Services	<i>Criterion met.</i> This proposal includes provisions for connecting to existing public utilities including public water and sanitary sewer. Any additional requirements and details will be addressed as part of the building permit.	
Stormwater Management	<i>Criterion met.</i> The final plans include provisions for providing treatment of stormwater. Any additional requirements and details will be addressed as part of the building permit.	
Phasing	<i>Criterion not applicable.</i>	
Consistency with BSD Principals	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposal will continue to provide an interesting, walkable setting for urban lifestyles that places value on human scale and a diversity of experiences. The site layout and architecture are consistent with these principles.	

ARB Board Order		Standards of Review
Criteria	Section 153.174 of the Zoning Code identifies criteria for the review and approval of a Board Order for proposals within the Architectural Review District Boundaries. The following is an analysis based on those criteria.	
General Review Standards		
3) General Character	a) <i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed structure was designed to be compatible with the surrounding historic structures without competing with its character. Architectural features such as lap siding, dormers, windows, stone, metal roofing, and lighting were selected to reflect the surrounding period character of this area of the district.	

ARB Board Order	Standards of Review
4) Architectural Style	<i>Criterion met.</i> Simple rectangular commercial buildings and outbuildings with exterior construction of frame with horizontal siding and corner trim, one, one and one-half, or two stories high with gable roof and ridgeline parallel to the street, mainly of the era of 1820 to 1890. The proposed materials, layout, height are appropriate in the context and character of the surrounding neighborhood and was designed to complement the historic significance of the surrounding buildings without detracting from their original character.
5) Massing Building and Form	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed building and layout was designed to meet the height requirements of the district and to step down with the existing grade to be more compatible with the surrounding properties.
6) Color	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed colors are traditional and consistent with the colors used elsewhere in the area.
7) Signs	<i>Criterion not applicable.</i> No signs are proposed as part of this application.
8) Landscaping	<i>Criterion met with conditions.</i> The proposed landscape plan will meet the diversity in plant selection and appropriateness for the environment.
9) Archaeological	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed project will require significant excavation of the site and efforts should be made to protect and preserve any archeological finds of significance.
Alterations to Site	
(1) Minimal alteration	<i>Criterion met.</i> Although the proposed project alters the existing topography of the site, and will implement retaining walls up to 12 feet in height behind the existing structures efforts have been made by the applicant to minimize this impact through material selection that is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood, landscaping, and orientation of the building.
(2) Conform to character of site	<i>Criterion met.</i> Efforts have been made by the applicant to minimize this impact through material selection that is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood, landscaping, and orientation of the building.
(3) Distinguishing qualities should not be destroyed	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposal will require the access to the rear of the existing buildings to be reconfigured, which may require the removal or alteration of historic material in these locations. However, the applicant will make efforts to select material and style that conform to the historical period of the structure.
Additions to Site	
(2) Contemporary designs should not be discouraged when compatible	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed design is contemporary but compatible to the character of the existing architectural context.
(3) Additions should be clearly distinguishable	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed building is not attached to either of the existing structures, and is located to the rear.

ARB Board Order	Standards of Review
(4) All sites shall be recognized as products of their own time	<i>Criterion met.</i> The addition of the proposed building to the site does not diminish the integrity of the existing buildings on the site, and will stand as a product of its own time.

Historic Dublin Design Guidelines	New Construction Standards
(1) Placement and Orientation on the Lot	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed new building is designed to appear as if it were three individual structures with shared walls, similar to other recent new mixed-use construction in Historic Dublin. It is oriented toward Eberly Hill—a narrow side street—which is a departure from the existing development pattern of Historic Dublin. However, this orientation may represent the most viable option for commercial or mixed-use infill construction in this area, given the transition in land use from commercial to residential to the east across South Blacksmith Lane and the sensitivity this requires.
(2) Scale and Proportion	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed building has been designed to appear as a series of three smaller structures sharing common walls. The building is pedestrian scaled along Eberly Hill. This is in part because of the change in grade along the proposed sidewalk and the building transitions from a story and a half at the west end to two and a half at the east.
(3) Height	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed building is designed as a two and a half story building, with the half story located within the roof structure. The resulting roof height is slightly higher than roofs of typical structures in the Historic District as a function of creating habitable space above the second floor and under the roof. The overall height proposed is approximately one foot taller than the roof peak of 78 South High Street due to the elevator proposed in the building.
(4) Materials, Textures, and Colors	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed exterior materials are smooth fiber cement siding and cultured stone. These are contemporary interpretations of wood and stone that have been used in other new construction in the area.
(5) Massing, Form, and Roof Shape	<i>Criterion met.</i> The mass of the proposed building is generally a simple rectangle, with minor recesses along the length of the façade. The proposed building has three basic roof forms—two of which are gabled with cross gables and dormers, with a gambrel roof between them. Efforts have been made by the applicant to hide ridge lines and create a cohesive roof design. The gabled portions of the roof employ ‘false ridgelines’ on both sides of the structure that actually terminate at a small flat roof area in order to manage the overall height of the structure.
(6) Rhythm of Openings	<i>Criterion met.</i> The rhythm of the openings in the proposed building is consistent with that of nearby buildings.
(7) Window-to-Wall Ratio	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposal is for a mixed-use building, with general office uses in the ground story and residential dwelling units above. These uses and the style of building proposed will typically have a lower window to wall

Historic Dublin Design Guidelines	New Construction Standards
	ratio than retail or other commercial uses, due to the need for privacy associated with these uses. The window to wall ratio proposed is also appropriate to the style of architecture proposed.

Historic Dublin Design Guidelines	Site Considerations
(1) Fences and Walls	<i>Criterion met.</i> The proposed development requires significant regrading of the site to the rear of the existing and proposed buildings to create a parking lot to serve the existing and proposed uses. This has necessitated significant retaining walls and fence on the south property line and approximately 12 feet behind the existing buildings. The applicant has proposed to minimize the impact of the walls through use of high quality materials and landscaping consistent with the character of existing walls in Historic Dublin.

Recommendation	Site Plan Review
Waiver Summary	Recommendation of approval of ten Site Plan Waivers to the Architectural Review Board.
Waiver Requests	<i>Approval</i> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Roof Type Requirements (3) 2) Parking Location 3) Transparency Requirements (2) 4) Building Entrances 5) Permitted Materials 6) Retaining Wall Height 7) Foundation Plantings
Parking Plan	Recommendation of approval of the Parking Plan to the Architectural Review Board to approve a decrease to the number of required parking spaces from 22 to 20 spaces.
Open Space	Approval of a fee paid in lieu of the provision of open space.
Site Plan Review	Recommendation of approval of the Site Plan Review to the Architectural Review Board with the following conditions:
<i>Conditions</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) That the applicant works with staff to relocate transformers and AC units to a location more interior to the site, to the extent possible; 2) The applicant reduce size of upper balcony (length and depth) and detach upper balcony from the lower balcony. 3) The applicant work with staff to identify a more appropriate location for the bicycle parking area. 4) The applicant revise the plan to show use a stacked stone wall for the street wall provided on Blacksmith Lane in accordance with Code. 5) Additional shrubs, of a similar mix as currently shown, be provided along

Recommendation	Site Plan Review
	<p>the northerly street wall along Blacksmith Lane to meet Code.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">6) The applicant ensure all light fixtures and site photometrics meet Code, and any outstanding information be provided as part of the building permit.7) The applicant file an application to combine the two lots prior to issuance of building permit.8) The applicant will conceal all roof penetrations (fans, exhaust, vents, etc.) and ensure these will not be visible from principal frontage streets.9) The doors for commercial uses along the street frontages shall be consistent with the design of the principal entrances and include full glass and full operating hardware.10) The applicant will ensure all recesses and/or projections required for vertical façade divisions shall meet the required depth of 18 inches.11) All sign details shall be approved by ARB, prior to the installation of signs.12) The construction of the proposed development is subject to the approval of the demolition request.13) Should a change of use occur to include a different mix of uses for the existing or proposed buildings that require additional parking provisions, the applicant would be required to gain approval of a modified parking plan from the ARB.14) Northern portion of the proposed street wall be relocated to provide screening of the A/C units, gas meters, and transformer on the eastern side of the building.15) Dormers should be recessed 12 inches.16) Approval of the western elevation design is subject to the building permit review process.

ANALYSIS & DETERMINATIONS – SITE PLAN

Applicable Development Plan Review Criteria

Includes §153.059 – Uses, §153.062 – Building Types, §153.064 – Open Space Types, and §153.065 – Site Development Standards

153.059 – Uses

Code Section	Proposed Uses	Permitted
Table 153.059-A	<u>Proposed Building:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Office, General (3,007 square feet per App. Materials) Dwelling, Multiple-Family (2 dwelling units, # Bedrooms not Provided) <u>Existing Buildings:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Office, General (3,175 square feet) 	Yes

153.062 – Building Types

Code Section	Requirement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analysis 	Met?
(B) General Building Type Requirements		
(2)	Existing Structures	
(a)	Where one or more lawful principal buildings exist on a site that do not comply with the requirements of this chapter...the structures(s) may be continued as existing at the effective date of this amendment if the requirements of §153.062(B)(2) are met. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two existing structures are present on the proposed development parcel. There are no modifications proposed to these structures with this application, and the applicable provisions of §153.062(B)(2) are met. 	Met
(f)	3. Exceptions. All new construction in the BSD Historic Core District shall meet the requirements of §153.062, §§153.170 through 153.180, and the Historic Dublin Design Guidelines.	Met
(3)	General Requirements	
(a)	Zoning Districts: Each building type shall be constructed only within its designated BSD zoning district. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed structure is a Historic Mixed-Use Building, and is permitted within the BSD Historic Core District 	Met
(b)	Uses: Each building type may house the uses allowed in the district in which it is located <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed uses are permitted within the proposed Historic Mixed-Use Building. 	Met
(c)	No Other Building Types: All Principal buildings shall meet the requirements of Table 153.062-A, Permitted Building Types in Each BSD Zoning District. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed Historic Mixed-Use Building is permitted within the Historic Core Neighborhood District. 	Met

153.062 – Building Types

(d)	Permanent Structures: All buildings constructed shall be permanent structures without a chassis, hitch, wheels or other features that would make the structure mobile. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed building is a permanent structure</i> 	Met
(e)	Accessory Structures: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>No accessory structures are proposed</i> 	N/A
(C) General Building Type Layout and Relationships		
(1)	Incompatible Building Types. Are not permitted directly across the street from one another or on the same block face, unless otherwise permitted by the required reviewing body. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed Historic Mixed-Use Building type is compatible with all adjacent existing structures. (Which are determined as Single Family Detached, Historic Mixed-Use, and Historic Cottage Commercial)</i> 	Met
(D) Roof Type Requirements		
(2)	Pitched Roof Type.	
(a)	Roof Structure. Hipped and gable roofs are permitted, in addition to roofs with combinations of hips and gables. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Proposed roof is a combination of compound gabled and hipped roofs. The middle portion of the roof is a gambrel roof, and the flanking roofs are pitched with a flat roof area on each as a result of the roof pitch being 'clipped' to minimize the height of the roof.</i> 	Waivers Required
(b)	Pitch Measure. 1. Principal roof shall have a pitch appropriate to the architectural style. Roofs shall not be sloped less than a 6:12 pitch or more than 12:12 (rise: run). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Proposed roof pitch of all principal roofs is 12:12.</i> 	Met
	3. Where pitched roofs without closed ridges are used, the roof ridge must be designed to appear closed as view from all directions, and to the extent practicable from buildings of similar height in adjacent BSD zoning districts. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>No unclosed ridges are proposed. A gambrel roof style is proposed in the middle portion (See '(h)' below). It is flanked by pitched roofs that terminate with a flat roof area on top, which will appear as a typical closed ridge pitched roof from all directions.</i> 	Met
	4. Unless determined to be architecturally appropriate to the style of the building, a pitch greater than 3:12 is required on roofs of dormers, porches, balconies, or other minor roofs. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed pitch on all gable dormers is 12:12, and the proposed pitch on the upper slope of the gambrel roof and the shed dormers is 3.75:12.</i> 	Met
(c)	Parallel Ridge Line. 1. When appropriate to the character and where the principal ridge line of any building type runs parallel to any street, gabled ends, perpendicular ridge lines, or dormers shall be incorporated to interrupt the mass of the roof. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Gable ends and dormers are proposed perpendicular to principal ridge lines which run parallel to Eberly Hill and South Blacksmith Lane.</i> 	Met

153.062 – Building Types

(d)	<p>Dormer Design.</p> <p>Dormers shall be scaled and detailed appropriate to the architectural character. Dormer windows should be sized in relation to the windows used in the upper story, and dormers should be no wider than necessary to accommodate the window and trim. Visibility into permanently unfinished space is prohibited where dormer windows are installed.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The dormers are scaled appropriately to the character of the building, sized in relation to the upper story windows, and no wider than necessary. No unfinished space is proposed in areas where dormers are proposed. Recommend that all dormers be pulled back at least a foot from the plane of the exterior wall below.</i> 	Met with condition
(e)	<p>Gable Ends.</p> <p>An architecturally appropriate element such as a vent, window or other decorative element is required on street-facing gable ends.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The gable end facing Eberly Hill incorporates a window.</i> 	Met
(f)	<p>Roof Height.</p> <p>In the BSD Historic Core district, roofs without occupied space and/or dormers shall have a maximum height on street-facing elevations equal to the maximum floor height permitted for the building type, or as otherwise approved by the Architectural Review Board.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed roof has occupied space and dormers within the roof structure. The proposed roof height (from eave to ridge) is approximately 13.83 feet.</i> 	Met
(g)	<p>Occupied Space.</p> <p>A half story of occupied space may be incorporated within a pitched roof type.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>A half story is proposed within the roof structure of the pitched roof.</i> 	Met
(h)	<p>Gambrel and Mansard Roofs.</p> <p>1. Gambrel and mansard roofs are permitted only for single family detached buildings, unless otherwise determined to be architecturally appropriate by the required reviewing body for other building types.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>A gambrel roof is proposed in the middle portion of the proposed building.</i> 	Waiver Required/ Arch. Approp. Determination
	<p>2. For all building types, when the ridge of a gambrel or mansard roof runs parallel to the street, dormers or cross gables must be incorporated with spacing and scale appropriate to the length and architectural character of the building.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The ridge of the proposed gambrel roof runs parallel to Eberly Hill and four dormers are proposed.</i> 	Met (Pending Arch. Approp. Determination)

(E) Materials

(1)	Façade Materials	
(a)	<p>Percentage of Primary Materials Required:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Please refer to 153.062(O) - Building Type Analysis.</i> 	See Table Below
(c)	<p>Permitted Primary Materials:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Please refer to 153.062(O) – Building Type Analysis</i> 	See Table Below
(d)	<p>Permitted Secondary Materials:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Please refer to 153.062(O) - Building Type Analysis.</i> 	See Table Below

153.062 – Building Types

(f)	EIFS and architectural metal panels and cladding shall not be used in the Historic Core District. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>None of the materials proposed has been specified as EIFS.</i> 	Met
(g)	To provide visual depth and strong shadow lines, clapboard siding shall have a minimum butt thickness of a quarter of an inch. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Proposed Hardie Siding (fiber cement siding) is a consistent thickness of 5/16".</i> 	Met
(h)	Other high quality synthetic materials may be approved as permitted primary or secondary materials by the required reviewing body. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>All of the materials proposed and labeled are either permitted primary or secondary materials.</i> 	Met
(2)	Façade Material Transitions	
(a)	Vertical transition shall occur at inside corners <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>All vertical transitions in façade material occur at inside corners. (See Individual Building Type Requirements)</i> 	Met
(b)	Multiple Materials Proposed Vertically: Where proposed, the 'heavier' material in appearance shall be incorporated below the 'lighter' material. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Cultured stone is proposed below siding in locations where materials change vertically on façade.</i> 	Met
(c)	Transitions between different colors of same material: Shall occur at locations deemed architecturally appropriate by the required reviewing body. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>At the eastern portion of the building, lap siding (white) transitions vertically to board and batten siding (blue) and is separated by a horizontal molding.</i> 	Met (Arch. Appropriateness Determination)
(3)	Roof Materials	
(b)	Pitched roof materials include dimensional asphalt composite shingles with a 25 year or greater warranty, wood shingles and shakes, metal tiles or standing seam, slate and ceramic tile <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Architectural asphalt shingles and standing seam metal roofs are proposed.</i> 	Met
(c)	Roof materials for gambrel and mansard roofs shall be cedar shake, slate or metal. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Standing seam metal roof is proposed for gambrel roof.</i> 	Met
(e)	Roof penetrations (fans, exhaust, vents, etc.) shall be concealed and shall not be visible from principal frontage streets. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>South High Street is a principal frontage street,</i> 	Met with Condition
(4)	Colors	
	Colors for all building materials shall be selected from appropriate historic color palettes, from any major paint manufacturer, or as determined appropriate by the required reviewing body. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Proposed color palette is from James Hardie Industries, as the color is integral to the fiber cement siding proposed. The proposed palette is consistent with paint colors used in the BSD Historic Core and Historic Transition Districts.</i> 	Met

(F) Entrances & Pedestrianways

153.062 – Building Types

(1)	Entrances & Pedestrianways – Quantities and Locations See Building Type Requirements Table	
(2)	Recessed Entrances. Entry doors shall be recessed a minimum of three feet from property lines <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>All entrances are recessed a minimum of three feet from property lines.</i> 	Met
(3)	Entrance Design	
(a)	All principal entrances are to be at a pedestrian scale, effectively address the street and be given prominence on the façade through the use of architectural features. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The principal entrance is in the middle portion of the proposed building, facing Eberly Hill. It is at a pedestrian scale, effectively addresses the street and is given prominence by being recessed into the façade and designed as a double door.</i> 	Met
(c)	Doors for commercial uses along all street frontages shall be consistent with the design of principal entrances and include full glass and full operating hardware. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Doors on all street frontages include full glass, but no operating hardware details have been submitted.</i> 	Met with Condition
(G) Articulation of Stories on Street Facades		
	Façades shall be designed to follow the stories of the building with fenestration organized along and occupying each floor. Story heights are set to limit areas of the façade without fenestration. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The facades are articulated to follow the line of each story.</i> 	Met
(H) Windows, Shutters, Awnings and Canopies		
(1)	Windows	
(a)	Transparency is required according to building type. <i>Please refer to Building Type Requirements</i>	
(b)	Highly reflective glass is prohibited	Met
(c)	Spandrel or heavily tinted glass cannot be used to meet minimum transparency requirements	Met
(d)	Windows may be wood, anodized aluminum, metal-clad or vinyl-clad wood, steel, or fiberglass.	Met
(f)	Windows within masonry walls shall have architecturally appropriate lintels and sills. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Where windows are proposed within the masonry portion of the façade, lintels and sills are proposed.</i> 	Met
(g)	Windows within siding clad walls shall have a projecting sill to serve as a base for either a minimum one by four trim or brick mould casing. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Where windows are proposed within siding clad walls, the elevations submitted depict window trim consistent with the requirement.</i> 	Met
(I) Balconies, Porches, Stoops, and Chimneys		
(1)	Balconies	
(a)	Size. Balconies shall be a minimum open area of six feet deep and five feet wide. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Three balconies are proposed, and the minimum balcony size is 18 feet deep and 19 feet wide</i> 	Met

153.062 – Building Types

(b)	Connection to Building. Balconies may be recessed into a building façade, if not recessed into façade, balconies must be independently secured and unconnected to other balconies above or below. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The balcony proposed at the third story is connected to the balcony below.</i> 	Met with Condition
(c)	Façade Coverage. A maximum of 40% of each front and corner side facades may be covered with balconies. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>No balconies are proposed on the front or corner side facades.</i> 	Met
(3)	Stoops	
(a)	Size. Stoops shall have a minimum width and depth of five feet of open area and may be located on the front or corner side of the building. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Three stoops are proposed—at the west elevation, north elevation and northeast corner of the building. The minimum width and depth of the smallest stoop is 5.6 feet.</i> 	Met

(J) Treatments at Terminal Vistas

When a street terminates at a parcel, the parcel shall be occupied by either an open space with a vertical element to terminate the view or by the front or corner side of a building. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>There are no terminal vistas in this location</i> 	N/A
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

(K) Building Variety

Building designs must vary from adjacent buildings by the type of dominant material (or color, scale or orientation of that material). Building designs must also vary through at least 2 of the following:

- (1) The proportion of recesses and projections
- (2) A change in the location of the entrance and window placement
- (3) Changes to the roof design, including roof type, plane, or material
- (4) Pronounced changes in building height

	Dominant Material	(1) Recesses and Projections	(2) Entrance/ Window Placement	(3) Roof Design	(4) Change in Height
Adjacent Building	Required	2 of 4 Required			
<i>58 South High Street</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>		<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>
<i>76 South High Street</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>
<i>73 South Riverview Street</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>	<i>X</i>

(M) Signs

(1)	Signs attached to the principal structure shall be coordinated with the architecture of the building in terms of design, color scheme, location and lighting	Condition
(2)	Locations of all signs intended to be affixed to the principal structure, or at any time in the future by subsequent tenants, shall be identified on the architectural elevations submitted.	Condition
(3)	Other sign requirements not specified in this section shall meet the requirements of 153.065(H).	See 153.065 (H)

(N) Individual Building Type Requirements

Refer to following section for detailed analysis of the building.

153.062(O) – Individual Building Requirements Analysis

153.062(O)(9) – Historic Mixed Use Building

Building Type Requirements	Code Requirement	Provided	Met?
(a) Building Siting			
1. Street Frontage			
Number of Principal Buildings Permitted (per Lot)	Multiple Permitted	<i>3 Proposed</i>	Met
Front Property Line Coverage	Minimum 80%	<i>90% Provided at Eberly Hill (in combination w/ 76 S. High)</i>	Met
Occupation of Corner Required (Yes/No)	Yes	<u><i>Eberly Hill & South Blacksmith Lane</i></u> <i>Yes</i> <u><i>South High Street & Eberly Hill</i></u> <i>Yes (existing 76 S. High)</i>	Met
Front Required Building Zone	0-20 feet* When any front or corner property line is w/in 5 ft. or less of back of curb, RBZ shall begin 5 ft. off of the back of curb to allow adequate sidewalk width.	<i>Front RBZ = Eberly Hill 5 ft. provided</i>	Met
Corner Side Required Building Zone	0-10 feet* *See note above	<i>Corner Side RBZ = South Blacksmith Lane 13.67' provided</i>	Met
Required Building Zone Treatment	Patio or Streetscape; porches, stoops, and balconies permitted in RBZ	<i>Streetscape proposed</i>	Met
Right-of-Way Encroachments	Projecting Signs, Awnings, Eaves, Patios & Canopies	<i>None Proposed</i>	Met
2. Buildable Area			
Minimum Side Yard Setback Required	0 ft.	<i>40.38 feet to South High Street right-of-way 6.83 feet to 76 South High Street</i>	Met
Minimum Rear Yard Setback Required	0 ft.	<i>41.59 feet</i>	Met
Minimum Lot Width Required	30 ft.	<i>166 feet</i>	Met
Maximum Lot Width Required	None	<i>N/A</i>	N/A

153.062(O)(9) – Historic Mixed Use Building

Building Type Requirements	Code Requirement	Provided	Met?
Maximum Impervious Lot Coverage	85%	<i>83.6% per applicant</i>	Met
Additional Semi-Pervious Lot Coverage Permitted (Beyond Max. 85% Impervious Coverage)	5%	<i>3.2% per applicant</i>	Met
3. Parking Location & Loading			
Parking Location	Rear	<i>Rear</i>	Met
Loading Facility Permitted (location relative to principal structure)	Not Applicable	<i>None</i>	N/A
Entry for Parking within Building (relative to principal structure)	Not Applicable	<i>Two, two-car attached garages proposed at the rear of the building</i>	Waiver
(b) Height			
Minimum Building Height Permitted (ft.)	1.5 stories	<i>1.5 stories min. proposed</i>	Met
Maximum Building Height Permitted (ft.)	2.5 stories	<i>2.5 stories max. proposed</i>	Met
Ground Story Height	10 ft. Minimum 12 ft. Maximum	<i>12 ft. proposed at east end 11 ft. proposed at west end (Grade change across elevation)</i>	Met
Upper Story Height	9 ft. Minimum 12 ft. Maximum	<i>11 ft. proposed at east end.</i>	Met
(c) Uses & Occupancy Requirements			
Ground Story Use Requirements	Residential uses prohibited; Podium parking structures are conditional uses in accordance with 153.059(C)(3)(g)	<i>'Office, General' use proposed at Ground Story (both ends of building)</i>	Met
Upper Story Use Requirements	No additional requirements	<i>N/A</i>	N/A
Parking within Building	Not permitted	<i>Parking proposed within building for Multiple-Family Dwelling units (Two, two-car garages at rear)</i>	Waiver
Occupied Space Required	Not applicable	<i>N/A</i>	N/A
(d) Façade Requirements			
1. Street Façade Transparency			
Ground Story Street Facing Transparency (%)	Storefront with minimum 40% Transparency	<i>Eberly Hill (North)=31.1% S. Blacksmith Lane (East)=33.4%</i>	Waivers Required
Upper Story Transparency	Minimum 20%	<i>Eberly Hill (North)=21% S. Blacksmith Lane (East)=20%</i>	Met

153.062(O)(9) – Historic Mixed Use Building

Building Type Requirements	Code Requirement	Provided	Met?
Blank Wall Limitations	Required	<i>None Present</i>	Met
2. Non-Street Façade Transparency			
Transparency (%)	Minimum 15% Transparency	<i>West Elevation=16% 1st Story South Elevation=13.9% 2nd Story South Elevation=16%</i>	Waiver Required
Non-Street Façade Blank Wall Limitations	Required	<i>None Present</i>	Met
3. Building Entrances			
Principal Entrance Location	Principal Frontage Street Façade of Building	<i>No frontage on a Principal Frontage Street. Entrance provided on Eberly Hill façade.</i>	Met
Street Facades: Number of Entrances Required	1 per 40 feet of façade for buildings over 60 feet minimum	<i><u>Eberly Hill</u> 3 Required, 1 Provided <u>South Blacksmith Lane</u> 1 Required, 1 Provided</i>	Waiver Required Met
Parking Lot Façade: Number of Entrances Required	Minimum of 1	<i>1 Provided</i>	Met
Mid-Building Pedestrianway	1 Required for buildings greater than 150 feet in length	<i>Building length is 111.67 feet.</i>	N/A
4. Façade Divisions			
Vertical Increments Required	No greater than 30 ft.	<i>33.67' wide increment at middle portion of building and no recesses or projections meet the minimum required depth of 18 inches.</i>	Met with Condition
Horizontal Façade Divisions Required (per ft. of façade)	N/A	N/A	N/A
Required Change in Roof Plane or Type	At every vertical division	<i>A change in roof plane and type is provided at the vertical divisions.</i>	Met
5. Façade Materials			
Permitted Primary Materials	Stone, Brick, Wood Siding	<i>Stone, Fiber Cement Siding Proposed as Primary Materials</i>	Waiver Required
Minimum Primary Façade Materials	80%	<i><u>North Façade (98%)</u> • Fiber Cement Siding (60%) • Stone (38%) <u>East Façade (99%)</u> • Fiber Cement Siding (92%) • Stone (7%) <u>South Façade (100%)</u></i>	Met With Waiver for Primary Material

153.062(O)(9) – Historic Mixed Use Building

Building Type Requirements	Code Requirement	Provided	Met?
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Fiber Cement Siding (67%)</i> • <i>Stone (33%)</i> <i>West Façade (100%)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Fiber Cement Siding (100%)</i> 	
Permitted Secondary Materials	Glass fiber reinforced gypsum, wood siding, fiber cement siding, metal and exterior architectural metal panels and cladding	<i>Fiber Cement Siding Proposed as Primary Material (see percentages above)</i>	Met
6. Roof Types			
Permitted Types	Pitched roof; other types permitted with approval	<i>Pitched roof with flat area and gambrel roof proposed</i>	Waiver Required
Tower	Permitted on facades only at terminal vistas, corners at two principal frontage streets, and/or adjacent to an open space type	<i>None Proposed</i>	N/A

153.064 – Open Space Types

Code Section	Requirement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Analysis</i> 	Met?
(C) Provision of Open Space		
(1)	<p>Residential.</p> <p>There shall be a minimum of 200 square feet of publicly accessible open space per residential unit. Required open space shall be located within 660 feet of the main entrance of a multiple-family building as measured along a pedestrian walkway.</p> <p><i>Two multiple family dwelling units are proposed, requiring 400 square feet of open space. In combination with the area required for commercial use proposed, a total of 530 square feet of publicly accessible open space are required. 1,110 square feet of plaza space is shown along the western edge of the proposed building, but is not publically accessible.</i></p>	Fee In Lieu
(2)	<p>Commercial.</p> <p>There shall be a minimum of one square foot of publicly accessible open space for every 50 square feet of commercial space or fraction thereof. Required open space shall be located within 660 feet of the main entrance of a multiple-family building as measured along a pedestrian walkway.</p> <p><i>Two multiple family dwelling units are proposed, requiring 400 square feet of open space.</i></p>	Fee In Lieu

153.064 – Open Space Types

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
	<i>In combination with the area required for commercial use proposed, a total of 530 square feet of publicly accessible open space are required. 1,110 square feet of plaza space is shown along the western edge of the proposed building, but is not publically accessible.</i>	
(D) Suitability of Open Space		
(1)	The ART or required reviewing body shall review all proposed open space types to determine the suitability of open space. In determining suitability of areas to be set aside for new open space types to meet the requirement, the ART or required reviewing body may consider all relevant factors and information, including but not limited to:	
(a)	The goals and objectives of the Community Plan and Parks and Recreation Master Plan;	
(b)	Suitability of the space for active or passive recreational use or preservation of natural features; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed open space consists principally of a 6.33' wide paver path providing access to the proposed and existing buildings.</i> <i>Given its location it will be perceived as private circulation/building access.</i> <i>There are few a few areas where seating might be accommodated, but no site furnishings are shown.</i> 	Fee In Lieu
(c)	The need for the specific type of open space and recreation in the Bridge Street District, particularly in the vicinity of the development taking into account the anticipated users; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed open space is largely disconnected from the public</i> <i>It is only accessible through narrow passages along Eberly Hill and South High Street, and via a stairway from the proposed parking area.</i> <i>The primary users of the space are anticipated to be the tenants/residents of the buildings surrounding the open space.</i> 	Fee In Lieu
(d)	The proximity or potential connectivity to other open space types. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed location is not connected to any other open space types in the vicinity.</i> 	N/A
(F) Open Space Types		
(1)	Pocket Plaza. Pocket Plazas are intended to provide a formal space for impromptu gathering, and a well-defined refuge from the public sidewalk. Seating areas are required and special features (i.e. public art, fountains) are encouraged. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed Pocket Plaza is generally imperceptible from the street and will only serve the tenants of the surrounding buildings.</i> <i>No seating areas or other features are provided.</i> 	N/A
(G) General Requirements		
(1)	Size	
(a)	Minimum/Maximum Acreage: 300 square feet / 1,200 square feet <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Proposed: 1,100 square feet</i> 	Fee In Lieu

153.064 – Open Space Types

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
	Minimum Dimension: 10 feet • <i>Proposed: Varies, minimum 10-feet</i>	
(b)	Proportion Requirement: With the exception of Greenways, open space types shall be sized at a ratio of not more than three to one (3:1), length to width. • <i>Proposed: not more than 3:1</i>	Fee In Lieu
(2)	Access	
(a)	Minimum Percentage of ROW Frontage Required. The minimum percentage of the open space perimeter, as measured along the outer edge of the space that shall be located directly adjacent to a street ROW to provide access and visibility to the open space. 30% along street/building required. • <i>Proposed: 71% along ROW + Building</i>	Fee In Lieu
(3)	Districts Permitted	
(b)	Frontage Orientation of Adjacent Buildings. The preferred orientation of the adjacent buildings' frontage in relation to open space: Front or Corner • <i>Proposed: Side/Rear (per property line designations)</i>	N/A
(4)	Improvements	
(b)	Site Furnishings. High quality, City-approved site furnishings are permitted and encouraged in all open spaces. • <i>No site furnishings proposed</i>	N/A
(c)	Public Art is highly encouraged as an amenity in all open space types: • <i>No public art locations proposed</i>	N/A
(f)	Maximum Impervious and Semi-Pervious Surface Permitted: Min. 40% Pervious required, Max. 80% + 10% • <i>Proposed: 0% Impervious + 78% Semi-Pervious</i>	N/A
(h)	Fencing and Walls: Walls shall not exceed 36 inches as measured from established grade. • <i>A wall is proposed along the eastern edge of the Pocket Plaza not exceeding 36 in.</i>	Waiver

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
(B) Parking and Loading		
(1)	General Provisions	
(b)	Parking Location 1. On-Site Parking	
	A. Surface parking on-site may only be located on those areas of the site that are not required to be occupied by a principal structure. The parking areas shall be readily available by vehicles, bicycles and pedestrians. • <i>The proposed on-site surface parking is in a permitted location and is readily</i>	Met

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement <ul style="list-style-type: none">Analysis	Met?				
	<i>accessible.</i>					
	B. Parking shall not be located within a setback as required for individual building types. <ul style="list-style-type: none">Required parking is proposed off-site within in a Parking Structure (not part of this application).	Met				
	Parking Location					
	3. On-Street Parking					
	On-street spaces may be counted toward meeting the minimum parking requirement, provided the spaces are on the same side of the street and within the lot lines of the parcel being served. <ul style="list-style-type: none">3 existing parking spaces on South High Street can be counted toward the minimum parking requirement.	Met				
(2)	Required Vehicle Parking					
(a)	Minimum Parking Required. Each use shall provide the minimum amount of parking required as listed on Table 153.065-A, and shall be permitted to provide up to the maximum amount of parking.					
	Proposed Use	Minimum Requirement for Proposed Use	Max. Spaces Permitted	Area/# Dwelling Units	Min. Spaces Required	Not Met Parking Plan Required
	Office, General	2.5 per spaces per 1,000 sf of gross floor area	125% of Minimum Required	6971 sf of gross floor area	18 spaces	
	Dwelling, Multiple-Family	Based on the # of bedrooms in each dwelling unit proposed.	2 per dwelling unit	2 dwelling units	4 spaces	
	Total Parking Required (Minimum):				22 Spaces	
	Total Parking Provided: (3 On-Street, 4 in garages, and 13 in an On-Site surface lot)				20 Spaces	
(b)	Adjustments to Required Vehicle Parking					Parking Plan Required
6. Demonstration of Parking Need. The required reviewing body may approve a parking plan for fewer than the minimum required parking spaces or more than the maximum based on a demonstration of parking need by the applicant. <ul style="list-style-type: none">20 parking spaces are proposed, 2 less than the minimum required.						
(c)	Accessible Parking Spaces Within the total number of off-street spaces provided, a minimum number of accessible parking spaces shall be provided consistent with Ohio Building Code. <ul style="list-style-type: none">Based on the proposed provision of 20 parking spaces, 1 accessible parking space is required and provided.					Met

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
(3)	Required Bicycle Parking	
(b)	<p>Minimum Number of Spaces Required.</p> <p>1. Bicycle parking shall be provided as follows:</p> <p>A. For residential uses, one space is required for every 2 dwelling units.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two dwelling units are proposed, requiring 1 bicycle parking space <p>C. For commercial uses, one space is required for every 10 required vehicular spaces.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 18 vehicular spaces are required for the commercial use, requiring 2 bicycle parking spaces. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>A total of 3 spaces are required. The Architectural Site Plan depicts bike racks to the south of existing 82 South High building. This location is not large enough to accommodate parked bicycles and maintain pedestrian circulation. Proposed condition to address this.</i> 	Met with Condition
(C) Stormwater Management		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Stormwater is proposed to be managed in a StormTech system under the parking lot.</i> 	
(D) Landscaping and Tree Preservation		
(2)	General	
(b)	Each application for development shall include a landscape plan, and the siting of buildings shall avoid the removal of desirable trees in good or fair condition, where alternate building siting is available.	N/A
(c)	Protected trees shall be replaced in accordance with §153.146	N/A
(e)	<p>Landscape Plans shall exhibit diversity in tree selection, as determined by City Forester and Director of Parks & Open Space</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The Landscape Plans specify a single tree species (Lilac), two shrub species (Boxwood and Arborvitae), and Daylilies. This plant list does not provide diversity.</i> 	To be met at Building Permit
(f)	<p>In all areas where landscaping is required, the surface area of the bed shall be predominantly covered within four years after installation by living materials, rather than by bark, mulch, gravel or non-living materials.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Additional information is needed regarding proposed areas to be covered with hardwood mulch.</i> 	To be met at Building Permit
(k)	<p>A registered landscape architect shall be used to prepare landscape plans required for applications for Site Plan Review.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>No landscape architect's name or seal appears on the plan submitted.</i> 	To be met at Building Permit
(5)	Surface Parking and Circulation Area Landscaping	

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
(a)	<p>Street Frontage Screening. Surface parking lots and other vehicular use areas located within 40 feet of a public street shall either be landscaped or a street wall shall be installed</p> <p>2. Where a surface lot is located within 20 feet of any street right-of-way, the property owner shall install a street wall in accordance with 156.065(E)(2) and at least five deciduous or evergreen shrubs per 25 lineal feet of parking lot boundary facing the public street. Trees are permitted but not required</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Two Street Walls are proposed on the Architectural Site Plan, but not the Landscape Plan (See Street Wall requirements below).</i> • <i>Based on 58 lineal feet of parking facing the street, a total of at least 15 deciduous or evergreen shrubs are required along the street wall, and 14 Arborvitae are proposed within the landscape island, but are not coordinated with the street wall.</i> 	To be met at Building Permit
(c)	<p>Interior Landscaping</p> <p>1. A minimum of 5% of the interior parking lot area (total area of parking spaces and drive aisles) shall be landscaped.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The interior parking area is approximately 4,695 square feet, requiring 249 square feet of interior landscaping. This has been provided in 4 peninsulas totaling 716 square feet.</i> 	Met
	<p>2. The interior landscaping shall be landscaped with one of three options listed. Option 'A' (<i>proposed</i>) requires all islands or peninsulas to have a minimum width of 10 feet and a minimum area of 150 square feet; a medium deciduous tree is required for every 12 spaces.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The peninsula at the south end of the parking lot is 9 feet wide, all other dimensional and area requirements are met by the peninsulas proposed to meet interior landscape requirements.</i> • <i>2 medium deciduous trees are required based on 13 spaces in the surface lot, and a total of 6 Lilac Trees are proposed within the peninsulas.</i> 	Met
	<p>4. When a landscape peninsula abuts the length of a parking space, a clear space shall be provided for pedestrians of turf, pavers, mulch or other similar non-vegetative material.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Street walls directly abut parking spaces in two locations, and the stairs abut another location.</i> 	Met
	<p>5. Each interior landscape area must include at least one deciduous shade tree to be counted toward the required landscape area, and the remaining area must be landscaped with mulch, shrubs, perennials or ground cover. Shrubs or perennials shall not exceed two feet in height.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Each interior landscape area includes at least one tree, but not a deciduous shade tree. A total of 6 Lilac trees are proposed. Hardwood mulch is proposed in all peninsulas, and several peninsulas also include daylilies.</i> 	Quantity Met Type to be met with Building Permit

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
	6. Required on-site drainage shall be incorporated into interior landscaped areas to maximum extent practicable consistent with standards in the City of Dublin Stormwater Management Design Manual. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Proposed management does not incorporate any drainage into landscape peninsulas. All drainage is across asphalt pavement to a trench drain running the length of the parking area to an underground Stormtech chamber.</i> 	To be met with Building Permit
(7)	Foundation Planting	
(a)	Building foundation landscaping is required along all sides of a building not otherwise occupied by entrances, sidewalk, parking or loading areas, or similar areas. Foundation landscaping is not required for portion of the front or corner side building façades located within 10 feet of the front property line and where a streetscape or patio is provided. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The front building façade is 5 feet from the front property line and no foundation planting is required in this location.</i> <i>Foundation planting is required along the corner side (east) and rear facade (south) and a portion of the side façade (west) of the building.</i> 	Met with Waiver
(b)	Where foundation planting is required, at least one shrub shall be provided per each 10 linear feet of building façade or fraction thereof. Landscape bed or raised planter must extend a minimum of 42 inches beyond the foundation. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The corner side façade is 46.33 feet in length, requiring 5 shrubs. A total of 14 shrubs are proposed within a landscape beds of ± 5 feet and ± 9 feet in depth.</i> <i>The side façade (adjacent to garage) is 19.42 feet in length, requiring 2 shrubs. Seven shrubs are proposed within a 3.25 feet deep landscape bed.</i> <i>The rear façade is 62.67 feet in length, requiring 7 shrubs. No landscape beds are provided.</i> 	To be met with Building Permit
(9)	Tree Preservation	
(a)	General Provisions 2. Tree Preservation Plan Required C. Applicants shall submit a Tree Preservation Plan for approval by the required reviewing body. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>No Tree Preservation Plans have been submitted.</i> 	N/A
(E) Fences, Walls and Screening		
(1)	Fence and Wall Standards	
	Notwithstanding the provisions of this section, the provisions of 153.064(G)(4)(h) shall be met with respect to fencing and walls for open spaces. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>A ± 12 foot high retaining wall is proposed at the eastern edge of the open space.</i> 	Waiver

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
(a)	Prohibited Materials. No fence, wall or retaining wall shall be constructed of materials not designed to be used for that purpose. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed retaining wall is constructed of a modular block gravity retaining wall system.</i> 	Met
(b)	Fence and Wall Height and Opacity. 1. No fence or wall located between the principal structure on a lot and the front property line shall exceed four feet in height or be more than 50% opaque. These provisions apply to all street frontages on multiple frontage lots. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>No walls are depicted between the front property line and the principal structure.</i> 	N/A (See provision (b)4)
	2. No fence or wall located between the principal structure on a lot and the side or rear property line shall exceed six feet in height. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Proposed retaining wall is approximately 12 feet in height as measured from established grade at the parking area.</i> 	N/A (See provision (b)4)
	4. The provisions of §153.065(E)(1)(b)1-2 shall apply to all portions of retaining walls that extend above grade level, as measured from the elevated side of the retaining wall. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Additional information is needed regarding the height to the top of the wall as measured from the elevated side of the wall (adjacent to the open space)</i> 	To be met with Building Permit
(2)	Street Wall Standards	
(b)	Design and Location 1. Street walls are intended to be placed within the front and/or corner side RBZ. If an RBZ is occupied by a building, the street wall shall be installed along the same plane as the nearest building façade. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>The proposed street wall is recessed from the plane of the nearest building wall by 2.83 feet.</i> 	Met
	3. Street walls in the BSD Historic Core shall be constructed as stacked stone walls, unless otherwise approved by the required reviewing body. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Based on the Architectural Elevations, the same cultured stone proposed for the building (Glen-Gery, Landmark Stone, Ashford Glen Ridge) is proposed for the street wall as rendered. Note that the thickness of the proposed walls are shown as 6 inches. Typical thickness of cultured stone veneer alone is 2 to 4 inches.</i> 	Met with Condition
	4. Street walls shall be a minimum of 22 inches where seating is intended; all other walls shall be a minimum of 30 inches and a maximum of 36 inches in height <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Walls between 30 and 36 inches in height.</i> 	Met
(c)	Street Wall Landscaping. In all areas where landscaping is required, within 4 years after installation a minimum of 80% of the surface areas of any landscape bed shall be covered by living materials. 1. Masonry Street Wall. At least 5 shrubs per 25 lineal feet of street frontage are	To be met with Building Permit

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
	<p>required on the street side of the wall.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> From the Architectural Elevations, a two 16.5 long masonry street walls are proposed, requiring 5 shrubs per wall. 7 shrubs are provided, but not adjacent to the street wall. 	
(3)	Screening	
(c)	<p>Ground Mounted Mechanical Equipment</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All ground mounted mechanical equipment shall be incorporated within the footprint of a principal structure or shall be fully screened from view on all sides by one of the following options: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape material which provides a minimum 50% year round opacity A living wall or vertical garden covered with vegetation to provide a minimum 50% year-round opacity A decorative wall or fence that incorporates at least one of the primary materials and colors of the nearest wall of the principal structure. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A transformer, air conditioners, and gas meters are proposed along the east side of the building, screened by a single row of arborvitae. Additional screening is required on the north and south sides of this equipment. Two air conditioners are proposed to the rear of the building at the west end within a landscape peninsula, and no screening is provided on the south and east sides of the units. 	Met with Condition
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Utility boxes shall be oriented with access doors facing away from the street right-of-way to the maximum extent practicable. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A Transformer is proposed along the east façade of the building facing South Blacksmith Lane within a landscape bed. It is not clear in which direction the access doors face. 	To be met with Building Permit
(d)	<p>Outdoor Waste and Storage Containers and Enclosures</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All waste, refuse and recycling containers shall be incorporated within the footprint of the principal structure to the maximum extent practicable. If impracticable, containers shall be screened from view on all sides by landscaping or a decorative wall finished to match the materials of the nearest wall of the principal structure and shall be fully opaque year round. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A dumpster enclosure is proposed in the southwest corner of the parking lot, surrounded by retaining walls and stairs. 	Met
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> The wall or screen shall be at least one foot taller than the height of the waste or storage container, to a maximum of 12 feet. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It is not clear if the enclosure proposed will screen the dumpster to a height of 1' above the tallest part of the container as required. 	To be met with Building Permit
(F) Exterior Lighting		
(1)-(12)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only specifications for the proposed light pole, base and globe style to be used in the parking area have been submitted. (Architectural Area Lighting--Decorative Base Cover DB9, with a Standard Acorn Globe) 	To be met with Building

153.065 – Site Development Standards

Code Section	Requirement • <i>Analysis</i>	Met?
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>No light source specifications for this fixture have been submitted.</i> <i>Building Mounted exterior fixture proposed on all facades is 'Bovolo Williamsburg Flush Mount Light'. No cuts sheets or specifications have been submitted for this fixture.</i> <i>No photometric site plan has been submitted.</i> 	Permit
(G) Utility Undergrounding		
(1)-(3)	<i>Per the Demolition Plan submitted, an existing power/cable pole is to be removed at the east end of the site along South Blacksmith Lane. This pole supports overhead electric and cable lines serving the two existing structures on-site, and potentially other structures to the north and south along South High Street.</i>	
(H) Signs (No signs are proposed as part of this application)		
(I) Walkability Standards		
(1)	Intent and Purpose	
	Enhance connectivity, improve pedestrian safety, and promote comfortable walking and sitting environments.	
(2)	Walkability Objective: Connectivity	
(a)	Mid-block Pedestrianways. Are required on all blocks exceeding 400 feet in length. <i>Block is 161 feet in length.</i>	N/A
(b)	Mid-building Pedestrianways. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Not required on Historic Mixed-Use Building Types.</i> 	N/A
(4)	Walkability Objective: Comfort and Convenience	
(a)	RBZ Treatment: All areas between the front and corner side property lines and the back of the RBZ or setback not occupied by a building shall be treated with either a landscape, patio or streetscape treatment as required by building type. 1. Where necessary to provide adequate sidewalk width in areas expected to have high volumes of pedestrian activity, a streetscape RBZ treatment may be required by the required reviewing body. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Streetscape is proposed along Eberly Hill</i> 	Met
(b)	Building Entrances: A principal building entrance shall be on any principal frontage street or the front façade of the building. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>A Principal Entrance is provided on the north elevation of the building—the front façade.</i> 	Met